Private Sector support for Marine Conservation – What Can Make It Happen?

Summary of the Chumbe Island Coral Park case
- Objectives & work done
- Lessons learned
- Getting the private sector on board...
- Who are the other players?
- A change of paradigms needed
- Looking into everybody’s incentives...

Chumbe Island Coral Park Ltd Zanzibar/Tanzania

Private conservation project, established 1991 for sustainable conservation management of uninhabited Chumbe Island
- Company mission non-commercial, while operations follow commercial principles
- Eco-tourism supports conservation & environmental education for local schoolchildren

Small totally protected Reef Sanctuary (1994)
- Non-exploitative & non-destructive use only (fringing reef 1km x 300m)
- Strict but non-violent enforcement by Park rangers (former fishers)

Forest Reserve (1995)
- Sanctuary for endangered species
  - Aders duiker
  - Coconut crab
Visitors’ Centre (1998)
- Eco-Architecture and Eco-Technology
- Visitors’ management and education (max 14 people per day)

Eco-lodge (7 bungalows)
- Rainwater catchment
- Composting toilets
- Greywater filtration
- Solar energy

Winning political and public support for the MPA:
- Village meetings (1991/92)
- Training fishers as Park Rangers (from 1992)
- Informal on-the-job training by volunteers
- Park Rangers “educate” fishers & help in emergency
- Advisory Committee
- Management Plan 1995-2005

Educational programs
- Awareness tours for Government officials
- School Excursion Program for snorkelling & nature trails (critical issue: are up-market guests disturbed by school children?)
**Policy, legal and institutional context: opportunities ...**

- Up to 1996: No legislation & institutions for marine conservation in Zanzibar
- Economic liberalisation & tourism creating a market for conservation

**... and limitations**

- Policy & regulations favour BIG corporate investors
- Low security of tenure (further weakened by 1996 Environmental Protection Act)
- No tax & other incentives for investing in environment
- Second tier constraints (red tape & corruption)
- Hurdles to non-governmental initiatives
- ‘Unfair’ competition from donor aid

**Partnerships & cost control**

- Government, NGOs & Zoos for school programs & protected species sanctuaries
- Volunteers & University researchers for R & M
- Sponsors for nature trails, patrol boats...
- Buy & fix equipment on informal markets

**Sustainability: operations covered by eco-tourism proceeds from 2000**

- Budget ca. 150,000 US$/yr.
- Staff: 4 expatriates, 30 Zanzibaris
- Lessons learned:
  - Red tape multiplied costs
  - Costly eco-technology
  - Need to go up-market
  - ...and for aggressive marketing
  - Critical: volatile tourism market
(Eco-)Tourism has a stake in coral reefs, for non-destructive use...

- Increases economic value of coral reefs
- Builds local ownership by attracting local investors, employing local people
- Offers sustainability & long-term benefits

Investors in eco-tourism play a role in marine conservation

- ARE ON THE GROUND, so can build local alliances with other resource users (formal & informal sector)
- May invest directly in marine conservation, e.g. private MPAs
- ...or manage small MPAs, core zones under contract
- ...also support Monitoring, surveillance, training, marketing

Incentives for the ‘right’ investors

- Eco-tourism market potential and accessibility of a particular marine area
- Conducive investment climate (BIG issue...)
- Security of tenure & of contracts (even bigger...)
- Less competition from over-funded donor projects...

But also: a change of paradigms needed...

The private sector – the Bad Guy (to be controlled, regulated & source of funds)???
- The ‘local community’ – not profit-oriented?
- Is private sector profit always incompatible with conservation?
- Government park authorities, donor agencies, NGOs – what are THEIR stakes?
Who belongs to the local community…?

… and who is the private sector here…?

- strong overlaps, links and interdependence between formal and informal economy,
- both use local resources and
- are part of local, regional, global trade networks

She also needs the formal private sector

- Producing a crop, for export only

People in the formal and the informal economy…

… belong to the private sector sharing a local resource…
...and need economic incentives

- that are often linked to a particular locality...
- so they have common interests THERE,
- and CAN be won for better management & conservation ON-SITE,
- IF sustainable use gives THEM BENEFITS. for example:...

Economic incentives of Eco-tourism operators are:

- Keep the local environment as pristine as possible
- Win support from local communities
- Oppose over-development and mass tourism
- Hands-on inexpensive training on-site, and effective & cost-conscious operations
- ... COMPATIBLE with reef conservation

What are his (our) incentives...?

- Donor funded ‘capacity building’ in **** hotels & frequent travels overseas
- ‘Sitting allowance’ for a 1-day meeting that equals a fishers’ monthly income
- Commissions & more from donor-funded building & consultancy contracts...

Over-funded donor projects:

- Tend to create bureaucracies at central level, taking resource control away from local people,
- Increase costs of management by introducing industrial country standards,
- Create vested interests that have little to do with local concerns,
- Crowd out local initiatives & participation.
The donor community, a ‘Cartel of Good Intentions’…

- is Big Business in Tanzania,
- has institutional interests, for ever higher turnover & long-term funding, as
- ‘Aid dependency’ employs many people nationally and internationally,
- but provides few incentives for involving local people & for sustainable coral reef conservation…
- …DILEMMA!

Who are Governments, Donors, NGOs accountable to?

Maybe:
- the Auditor General or the internal auditor?
- the Western taxpayer?
- the clientelist power base?

Rarely to local resource users of a MPA…!

Is true partnership possible without accountability…?

Contact: Sibylle Riedmiller
Sibylle@chumbeisland.com